

Additional Proposed Main Modification to the Charnwood Core Strategy: Sustainability Appraisal Addendum July 2015

- 1.1 This Addendum supplements the Sustainability Appraisal (SA) Addendum that was produced by LUC on behalf of Charnwood Borough Council in March 2015¹, in relation to the consultation on the proposed Main Modifications to the Core Strategy. The Main Modifications proposed at that time were prepared by Charnwood Borough Council to address issues raised during the Examination hearings that took place between December 2014 and January 2015 in relation to the Core Strategy.
- 1.2 As described in the March 2015 SA Addendum, LUC and the Council previously undertook SA (incorporating Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA)) of the Core Strategy throughout its development. The most recent full SA Report for the Core Strategy is the March 2013 SA Report for the Draft Core Strategy. A Supplementary SA Report was also produced in October 2013 to clarify how reasonable alternatives were identified as part of the 2012 Core Strategy Supplementary Consultation; the reasons for rejecting or selecting the reasonable alternatives in the 2012 Core Strategy Supplementary Consultation; and the implications of the revocation of the Regional Plan on reasonable alternatives for the overall spatial strategy considered throughout the Core Strategy preparation. **Table 1 in Appendix 1** signposts where the requirements of the SEA Directive have been met within the March 2013 SA Report, the October 2013 Supplementary Report, the March 2015 SA Addendum and this July 2015 SA Addendum.
- 1.3 The Main Modifications were consulted on by Charnwood Borough Council between 13th April and 26th May 2015. The March 2015 SA Addendum was published alongside the Main Modifications during the consultation period, and described the implications of each proposed change for the SA conclusions set out in the earlier March 2013 SA Report. The SA Addendum also included a summary of the cumulative sustainability effects of the Core Strategy and whether the cumulative effects identified in the March 2013 SA Report were affected by the proposed changes to the Core Strategy.
- 1.4 Since the consultation on the Main Modifications, an additional proposed change to the Core Strategy has been prepared. This proposed change relates to Policy CS16: Sustainable Construction and Energy and the supporting text to that policy. The purpose of the additional proposed change is to make the Core Strategy 'sound' taking into account the Ministerial Statement that was issued on the 18th June 2015². This July 2015 SA Addendum has been prepared to consider the potential sustainability effects of the options considered by the Council for addressing the Written Ministerial Statement, and the resulting proposed change to the Core Strategy.

Alternative options considered

- 1.5 The Inspector identified three alternative options for addressing the implications of the Written Ministerial Statement (WMS):
 - Option A - The Council undertakes work on identifying areas suitable for wind energy development (to be included in the Core Strategy).
 - Option B - Amend Policy CS16 to include the specific criteria for wind turbines set out in the WMS and set out a commitment to identify areas in a subsequent plan in the supporting text.

¹ Charnwood Core Strategy Main Modifications: Sustainability Appraisal Addendum (LUC, March 2015).

² <http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201516/cmhansrd/cm150618/wmstext/150618m0001.htm>

- Option C - Amend Policy CS16 to make it clear that it does not relate to wind turbines and explain that this issue will be dealt with in a subsequent plan and that in the meantime wind turbine proposals will be considered against the WMS.

- 1.6 Charnwood Borough Council appraised these three alternative options against the SA Framework to understand the potential sustainability implications of each option, as presented in **Table 2** in **Appendix 1**.
- 1.7 The likely effects of all three options on several of the SA objectives (5, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15 and 16) are negligible as there is no direct relationship between the options and those SA objectives.
- 1.8 Where potential effects were identified, the likely effects of Options A and B were broadly similar as both could be more likely to result in the development of wind turbines. While this may have negative effects on some of the environmental SA objectives including objectives 1: biodiversity, 2: landscape and 4: cultural heritage, there may also be positive effects on SA objectives 7: climate change and 17: economy.
- 1.9 The effects of Option C are likely to be more positive than Options A and B in relation to the environmental SA objectives as Option C could mean that wind turbines are less likely to be developed; however under that approach the potential benefits for climate change mitigation could be less likely to be achieved. The effects of Option C are less certain, as it is not clear how wind energy would be dealt with in a future plan.
- 1.10 The Council's proposed approach is to take forward Option B, and amend Policy CS16 to include the specific criteria for wind turbines set out in the WMS, also setting out a commitment to identify areas in a subsequent plan in the supporting text. Option B was selected because Option C was not considered by the Council to be reasonable in that Policy CS16 is supported by evidence of the renewables potential for Charnwood, which includes wind energy as part of that mix. Option A would require work on allocations which could be undertaken through the Allocations and Policies DPD. To try to include allocations within the Core Strategy would lead to delays in the production of the Core Strategy to the detriment of positively managing and securing growth.

Implications of the Proposed Main Modification for the SA findings to date

- 1.11 The implications of the proposed change for the SA findings to date are described in **Table 3** in **Appendix 1**. The proposed change to Policy CS16 does not affect the SA findings set out in the March 2013 SA Report (Appendix 8) and the cumulative effects of the Core Strategy remain as described in the March 2015 SA Addendum.

LUC
July 2015

Appendix 1 – Tables 1, 2 and 3

Table 1: Requirements of the SEA Directive and where these have been addressed in the March 2013 SA Report, March 2015 SA Addendum and this statement

SEA Directive Requirements	Where covered in the SA documentation
<p>Preparation of an environmental report in which the likely significant effects on the environment of implementing the plan or programme, and reasonable alternatives taking into account the objectives and geographical scope of the plan or programme, are identified, described and evaluated. The information to be given is (Art. 5 and Annex I):</p>	
<p>a) An outline of the contents, main objectives of the plan or programme, and relationship with other relevant plans and programmes</p>	<p>Chapter 1 and Appendix 1 of the March 2013 SA Report.</p>
<p>b) The relevant aspects of the current state of the environment and the likely evolution thereof without implementation of the plan or programme</p>	<p>Chapter 4 of the March 2013 SA Report.</p>
<p>c) The environmental characteristics of areas likely to be significantly affected</p>	<p>Chapter 4 of the March 2013 SA Report.</p>
<p>d) Any existing environmental problems which are relevant to the plan or programme including, in particular, those relating to any areas of a particular environmental importance, such as areas designated pursuant to Directives 79/409/EEC and 92/43/EEC.</p>	<p>Chapter 4 of the March 2013 SA Report.</p>
<p>e) The environmental protection objectives, established at international, Community or national level, which are relevant to the plan or programme and the way those objectives and any environmental considerations have been taken into account during its preparation</p>	<p>Appendix 1 of the March 2013 SA Report.</p>
<p>f) The likely significant effects on the environment, including on issues such as biodiversity, population, human health, fauna, flora, soil, water, air, climatic factors, material assets, cultural heritage including architectural and archaeological heritage, landscape and the interrelationship between the above factors. (Footnote: These effects should include secondary, cumulative, synergistic, short, medium and long-term permanent and temporary, positive and negative effects)</p>	<p>Chapter 6 and Appendix 8 of the March 2013 SA Report; Chapter 3 of the October 2013 Supplementary SA Report; Appendix 1 in the March 2015 SA Addendum and Table 3 in this July 2015 SA Addendum.</p>
<p>g) The measures envisaged to prevent, reduce and as fully as possible offset any significant adverse effects on the environment of implementing the plan or programme;</p>	<p>Chapter 6 and Appendix 8 of the March 2013 SA Report; Appendix 1 in the March 2015 SA Addendum and Table 3 in this July 2015 SA Addendum.</p>

SEA Directive Requirements	Where covered in the SA documentation
h) An outline of the reasons for selecting the alternatives dealt with, and a description of how the assessment was undertaken including any difficulties (such as technical deficiencies or lack of know-how) encountered in compiling the required information;	Chapter 5 of the March 2013 SA Report and Chapter 1 of the October 2013 Supplementary SA Report. Information about the alternatives considered in relation to the final Main Modification is also provided in paragraph 1.5 of this July 2015 SA Addendum.
i) a description of measures envisaged concerning monitoring in accordance with Art. 10;	Chapter 7 of the March 2013 SA Report.
j) a non-technical summary of the information provided under the above headings	A separate non-technical summary document was produced to accompany the March 2013 SA report.
The report shall include the information that may reasonably be required taking into account current knowledge and methods of assessment, the contents and level of detail in the plan or programme, its stage in the decision-making process and the extent to which certain matters are more appropriately assessed at different levels in that process to avoid duplication of the assessment (Art. 5.2)	Addressed throughout the SA documentation.
<p>Consultation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> authorities with environmental responsibility, when deciding on the scope and level of detail of the information which must be included in the environmental report (Art. 5.4) 	Consultation was undertaken on the SA Scoping Report in 2005. Some of the Scoping tasks have since been updated and were presented in the March 2013 SA Report.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> authorities with environmental responsibility and the public, shall be given an early and effective opportunity within appropriate time frames to express their opinion on the draft plan or programme and the accompanying environmental report before the adoption of the plan or programme (Art. 6.1, 6.2) 	Consultation has been undertaken in relation to each stage of the Core Strategy preparation, accompanied by SA documentation as described in Chapter 3 in the March 2013 SA Report. Appendices 2, 3 and 4 in that report set out the consultation responses received at each stage and how they have been addressed. The proposed Main Modifications for the Core Strategy were consulted on between April and May 2015 and the March 2015 SA Addendum was also published for consultation during that period. The additional proposed Main Modification that this SA Addendum relates to is being published for consultation between July and September 2015.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> other EU Member States, where the implementation of the plan or programme is likely to have significant effects on the environment of that country (Art. 7). 	N/A

SEA Directive Requirements	Where covered in the SA documentation
Taking the environmental report and the results of the consultations into account in decision-making (Art. 8)	
<p>Provision of information on the decision: When the plan or programme is adopted, the public and any countries consulted under Art.7 must be informed and the following made available to those so informed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the plan or programme as adopted • a statement summarising how environmental considerations have been integrated into the plan or programme and how the environmental report of Article 5, the opinions expressed pursuant to Article 6 and the results of consultations entered into pursuant to Art. 7 have been taken into account in accordance with Art. 8, and the reasons for choosing the plan or programme as adopted, in the light of the other reasonable alternatives dealt with; and • the measures decided concerning monitoring (Art. 9) 	To be addressed after the Core Strategy is adopted.
<p>Monitoring of the significant environmental effects of the plan's or programme's implementation (Art. 10)</p>	To be addressed after the Core Strategy is adopted.
<p>Quality assurance: environmental reports should be of a sufficient standard to meet the requirements of the SEA Directive (Art. 12).</p>	The SA documentation has been produced in line with current guidance and good practice for SEA/SA and this table demonstrates where the requirements of the SEA Directive have been met.

Table 2: Wind Energy Ministerial Statement and the Core Strategy – Sustainability Appraisal of Options SA Objectives	Option A <i>The Council undertakes work on identifying areas suitable for wind energy development [to be included in the Core Strategy].</i>	Option B <i>Amend Policy CS16 to include the specific criteria for wind turbines set out in the WMS and set out a commitment to identify areas in a subsequent plan in the supporting text</i>	Option C <i>Amend Policy CS16 to make it clear that it does not relate to wind turbines and explain that this issue will be dealt with in a subsequent plan and that in the meantime wind turbine proposals will be considered against the WMS.</i>
Environmental			
1: To maintain and enhance biodiversity, flora and fauna and geodiversity	<p>D/↓</p> <p>The effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. Wind turbines have the potential to damage habitats, to cause death to wildlife through collisions, to cause barotrauma and can interrupt migration patterns. This option could result in an increase in wind turbines within the Borough. An increase in wind turbines may have a minor negative effect on this sustainability objective because of increased potential risk to biodiversity. However, Option A also allows for suitable areas to be identified in areas which have less potential for negative effects upon biodiversity, flora and fauna. There are not considered to be any significant effects upon geodiversity.</p>	<p>D/↓</p> <p>Option B, like Option A would lead to identification of areas suitable for wind energy, albeit this would be in a subsequent plan. Like Option A, the effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. Wind turbines have the potential to damage habitats, to cause death to wildlife through collisions, to cause barotrauma and can interrupt migration patterns. This option could result in an increase in wind turbines within the Borough. An increase in wind turbines may have a minor negative effect on this sustainability objective because of increased potential risk to biodiversity. However, Option B also allows for suitable areas to be identified in areas which have less potential for negative effects upon biodiversity, flora and fauna, although this would not happen until a subsequent plan is prepared. There are not considered to be any significant effects upon geodiversity.</p>	<p>?/↑</p> <p>Evidence shows that the main potential for renewable energy in Charnwood is from wind energy. Option C, at least in the short term, is likely to reduce the amount of wind turbines that are developed, and therefore have a minor positive effect against this objective by reducing the potential for wind turbines to impact upon biodiversity. An uncertain effect has also been identified as it is unclear how wind energy would be dealt with in a future plan. There are not considered to be any significant effects upon geodiversity.</p>
2: To maintain and enhance townscape and landscape character	<p>D/↓</p> <p>The effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. This option could result in an increase in</p>	<p>D/↓</p> <p>Option B, like Option A would lead to identification of areas suitable for wind energy, albeit this would be in a</p>	<p>?/↑</p> <p>Evidence shows that the main potential for renewable energy in Charnwood is from wind energy. Option C, at least in the</p>

<p>Table 2: Wind Energy Ministerial Statement and the Core Strategy – Sustainability Appraisal of Options SA Objectives</p>	<p>Option A <i>The Council undertakes work on identifying areas suitable for wind energy development [to be included in the Core Strategy].</i></p>	<p>Option B <i>Amend Policy CS16 to include the specific criteria for wind turbines set out in the WMS and set out a commitment to identify areas in a subsequent plan in the supporting text</i></p>	<p>Option C <i>Amend Policy CS16 to make it clear that it does not relate to wind turbines and explain that this issue will be dealt with in a subsequent plan and that in the meantime wind turbine proposals will be considered against the WMS.</i></p>
	<p>wind turbines within the Borough. Wind turbines have the potential for a negative effect on this objective due to their potential prominence in the landscape and or townscape. An increase in wind turbines may therefore have a minor negative effect on this sustainability objective. However, Option A also allows for suitable areas to be identified in areas which have less potential for negative effects upon townscape and landscape character.</p>	<p>subsequent plan. Like Option A, the effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. This option could result in an increase in wind turbines within the Borough. The effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. Wind turbines have the potential for a negative effect on this objective due to their potential prominence in the landscape and or townscape. An increase in wind turbines may therefore have a minor negative effect on this sustainability objective. However, Option B also allows for suitable areas to be identified in areas which have less potential for negative effects upon townscape and landscape character, although this would not happen until a subsequent plan is prepared.</p>	<p>short term, is likely to reduce the amount of wind turbines that are developed, and therefore have a minor positive effect against this objective. An uncertain effect has also been identified as it is unclear how wind energy would be dealt with in a future plan.</p>
<p>3: To increase the vibrancy and viability of settlements</p>	<p>D/↓ The effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. Wind turbines have the potential to have negative effects on this sustainability objective, in particular upon sense of place and settlement identity. This option could result in an increase in wind turbines within the Borough. An increase in wind turbines may have a minor negative effect on this sustainability objective. However,</p>	<p>D/↓ Option B, like Option A would lead to identification of areas suitable for wind energy, albeit this would be in a subsequent plan. Like Option A, the effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. Wind turbines have the potential to have negative effects on this sustainability objective, in particular upon sense of place and settlement identity. This option could result in an</p>	<p>?/↑ Evidence shows that the main potential for renewable energy in Charnwood is from wind energy. Option C, at least in the short term, is likely to reduce the amount of wind turbines that are developed, and therefore have a minor positive effect against this objective. An uncertain effect has also been identified as it is unclear how wind energy would be dealt with in a future plan.</p>

Table 2: Wind Energy Ministerial Statement and the Core Strategy – Sustainability Appraisal of Options SA Objectives	Option A <i>The Council undertakes work on identifying areas suitable for wind energy development [to be included in the Core Strategy].</i>	Option B <i>Amend Policy CS16 to include the specific criteria for wind turbines set out in the WMS and set out a commitment to identify areas in a subsequent plan in the supporting text</i>	Option C <i>Amend Policy CS16 to make it clear that it does not relate to wind turbines and explain that this issue will be dealt with in a subsequent plan and that in the meantime wind turbine proposals will be considered against the WMS.</i>
	Option A also allows for suitable areas to be identified where there is less potential for negative effects upon the vibrancy and viability of settlements.	increase in wind turbines within the Borough. An increase in wind turbines may have a minor negative effect on this sustainability objective. However, Option B also allows for suitable areas to be identified where there is less potential for negative effects upon the vibrancy and viability of settlements.	
4: To conserve and enhance the historic and cultural environment	D/↓ The effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. Wind turbines have the potential have a minor negative effect upon the settings of historic or important buildings or sites. An increase in wind turbines may have a minor negative effect on this sustainability objective. However, Option A also allows for suitable areas to be identified in areas which have less potential for negative effects upon the historic and cultural environment.	D/↓ Option B, like Option A would lead to identification of areas suitable for wind energy, albeit this would be in a subsequent plan. Like Option A, the effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. The effect will depend on how areas suitable for wind energy are identified. Wind turbines have the potential have a minor negative effect upon the settings of historic or important buildings or sites. An increase in wind turbines may have a minor negative effect on this sustainability objective. However, Option B also allows for suitable areas to be identified in areas which have less potential for negative effects upon the historic and cultural environment.	?/↑ Evidence shows that the main potential for renewable energy in Charnwood is from wind energy. Option C, at least in the short term, is likely to reduce the amount of wind turbines that are developed, and therefore have a minor positive effect against this objective. An uncertain effect has also been identified as it is unclear how wind energy would be dealt with in a future plan.
5: The protect and improve surface and ground water quality and resources	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
6: To improve local air	0	0	0

Table 2: Wind Energy Ministerial Statement and the Core Strategy – Sustainability Appraisal of Options SA Objectives	Option A <i>The Council undertakes work on identifying areas suitable for wind energy development [to be included in the Core Strategy].</i>	Option B <i>Amend Policy CS16 to include the specific criteria for wind turbines set out in the WMS and set out a commitment to identify areas in a subsequent plan in the supporting text</i>	Option C <i>Amend Policy CS16 to make it clear that it does not relate to wind turbines and explain that this issue will be dealt with in a subsequent plan and that in the meantime wind turbine proposals will be considered against the WMS.</i>
quality	There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option	There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option	There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option
7: To reduce the Borough's contribution to and vulnerability to climate change including a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions	↑/? This option could result in an increase in wind turbines and to increase the use of renewable energy supplies, and so could result in a minor positive effect on this objective, although this is uncertain as it will depend on the extent to which wind farm developments come forward within the Borough.	↑/? This option could result in an increase in wind turbines and to increase the use of renewable energy supplies, and so could result in a minor positive effect on this objective, although this is uncertain as it will depend on the extent to which wind farm developments come forward within the Borough.	? An uncertain effect has been identified as it is unclear how wind energy would be dealt with in a future plan.
8: To reduce vulnerability to flooding	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
9: To reduce waste and conserve mineral resources	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
10: To protect soil resources and quality and make efficient use of land and buildings	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
Social			
11: To reduce poverty and social exclusion, reduce crime, anti-social behaviour and increase community safety	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
12: To increase healthy lifestyles	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
13: To ensure that the housing stock meet the	0 There is no significant relationship	0 There is no significant relationship	0 There is no significant relationship

Table 2: Wind Energy Ministerial Statement and the Core Strategy – Sustainability Appraisal of Options SA Objectives	Option A <i>The Council undertakes work on identifying areas suitable for wind energy development [to be included in the Core Strategy].</i>	Option B <i>Amend Policy CS16 to include the specific criteria for wind turbines set out in the WMS and set out a commitment to identify areas in a subsequent plan in the supporting text</i>	Option C <i>Amend Policy CS16 to make it clear that it does not relate to wind turbines and explain that this issue will be dealt with in a subsequent plan and that in the meantime wind turbine proposals will be considered against the WMS.</i>
housing needs of all sections of the community	between the objective and the option.	between the objective and the option.	between the objective and the option.
14: To increase access to a wide range of services and facilities	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
15: To increase access to the countryside, open space and semi urban environments (e.g. parks)	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
Economic			
16: To encourage a sustainable economy supported by efficient patterns of movement attractive to investors	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.	0 There is no significant relationship between the objective and the option.
17: To reduce disparities in economic performance and improve skills and employability	↑/? This option could result in an increase in wind turbines. Wind turbines can provide an alternative income and may increase diversification of the rural economy. For this reason there may be a minor positive effect against this objective, but this is uncertain.	↑/? This option could result in an increase in wind turbines. Wind turbines can provide an alternative income and may increase diversification of the rural economy. For this reason there may be a minor positive effect against this objective, but this is uncertain.	? An uncertain effect has also been identified as it is unclear how wind energy would be dealt with in a future plan.

Key to scores in Table 2

Symbol	Meaning
↑	Significant positive effect (i.e. a move towards the objective)
↑	Marginal or minor positive effect (i.e. a move towards the objective)
0	There is no relationship or no significant relationship between the objective and the policy/option
?	It is not known whether the policy/option will move towards or away from the objective (another form of uncertainty)
Neutral	Performance against this objective is neutral
↓	Significant negative effect (i.e. a move away from the objective)
↓	Marginal or minor negative effect (i.e. a move away from the objective)
D	Effect depends on how the policy is implemented (one form of uncertainty)
T	Denotes a temporary effect (Effects are permanent if this symbol is not used)

Table 3: Assessment of the additional Main Modification and its implications for the SA findings (as set out in the March 2013 SA Report)

Modification Reference	Policy/Page/ Paragraph	Modification	Implications for SA findings as set out in March 2013 SA Report
Policy CS16: Sustainable Construction and Energy			
MM21	Policy CS16 Pages 86 – 88 Amend policy Paragraph 7.63	<p><i>New Bullet after 7th Bullet</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>in the case of proposals for wind energy development involving one or more wind turbines, planning permission will only be granted if:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <u>The development site is in an area identified as suitable for wind energy in the Site Allocations and Development Management Development Plan Document or a Neighbourhood Plan; and</u> - <u>Following consultation, it can be demonstrated that the planning impacts identified by affected local communities have been fully addressed and therefore the proposal has their backing.</u> <p>7.63 . . . However, the significant value of our landscape, particularly the Charnwood Forest, means that any opportunities are predominantly on higher ground in the east of our Borough. <u>Policy CS16 takes account of the written ministerial statement published in June 2015 in relation to proposals for wind energy. It is intended to identify suitable areas for wind energy development in the Site Allocations and Development Management Development Plan Document.</u></p>	No change to SA findings – the changes to the policy and supporting text are made to reflect national policy with regards to wind energy and do not affect the SA findings. Should any areas or sites for wind energy be identified through the Site Allocations and Development Management Development Plan Document and/or a Neighbourhood Plan, they will be subject to SA and SEA as part of the preparation of those plans.